श्री आनन्द शर्मा : सभापति महोदय, मेरा...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट सुन लीजिए। इसे उठने दीजिए, आपकी जो आपत्ति होगी उसको भी मैं सुनूंगा...**(व्यवधान)**... उस आपत्ति को भी मैं सुनूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : मेरा यह कहना है कि इस विवादास्पद विषय पर काफी सवाल उठेंगे। तो जो लोग हाउस मे हैं उनको भी एलाउ करना पड़ेगा ताकि पूरा विस्तार से चर्चा हो पाए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : वह मैं देख लूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, हमको भी मौका दे दीजिएगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैं आपको भी पूरी तरह से सुनूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : वह विषय जो आपने बताया है जितना उन्होंने लिख कर दिया है, तो वह किस रूल के तहत चर्चा होगी, क्या कोई नोटिस दिया है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : हां, नोटिस दिया है, चेयरमैन की परमिशन से वे बोल रहे हैं और ऐसा आज नहीं हो रहा है और कई बार पहले भी हो चुका है कि चेयरमैन की परमिशन से माननीय सदस्यो को बोलने की अनुमति दी गई है। इन्होंने परमिशन ली है मुझसे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : हमको भी अनुमति दीजिएगा।

श्री सभापति : हां, दे दी मैंने। ...**(व्यवधान)**... बोलिएगा।

Political interference in the functioning of investigative agencies

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (Gujarat): Mr. Chairman, Sir, with a deep sense of distress and concern, we are constrained to raise this issue in this hon. House with regard to a complete subversion and misuse, for political purposes, of various central investigative agencies, which has taken place in the last seven months ...*(Interruptions)*...

AN HON. MEMBER: Sir, the NDA Government...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat...*(Interruptions)*...Speak about NDA Government when you...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, this House in the past, in relation to solitary incidents, has discussed this on several occasions. But the last seven months have now established that this Government in an arrogant and brazen manner has decided to disregard all norms of propriety, and, the political executive has started interfering in every key investigation being done by various agencies. In investigations which involve important functionaries of the ruling alliance and supporters of the ruling alliance, there

is now enough indication and material to show that how the investigative agencies are being persuaded, pressurised, and even directed to go soft, and, eventually close those investigations ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't interrupt...*(Interruptions)*... I will allow all the Members to speak...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, at the same time, selected leaders of the Opposition are being targeted and the investigative agencies have been set on a course, which is clearly political in direction.

Sir, standing at the same place where I am speaking from, I remember, on several occasions in the past few years, my friend, Mr. Kapil Sibal had repeatedly told this hon. House as to what extent the investigative agencies are to enjoy the autonomy and independence.

The role of these investigative agencies is to function clearly independent of the political executive. It is not only the rule of good governance, it is not only the rule of independence of these agencies, the autonomy of these agencies, but it is also now the mandate of law. Agencies such as the Enforcement Directorate, the Directorate of Revenue Intelligence, the Central Bureau of Investigation, all have a mandate under the law to decide independently whom to prosecute, whom not to prosecute; in which case to file an appeal, in which case not to file an appeal, and, the political executive of this country has to keep away from them.

Let me just tell you, Sir, that the Supreme Court while being concerned about the role of the investigative agencies, and, the independence which they have to maintain ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, is a debate going on?...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, perhaps a discussion is going on here...*(Interruptions)*... यह क्या डिबेट हो रही है।.....(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him speak ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Let me tell you...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, defending corruption is not a part of the CMP that the Left Parties should be so much concerned about this...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : नहीं, आप तो बैठिए, ...**(व्यवधान)**... कोई डिस्कशन नहीं है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : आप भ्रष्टाचार के केस में भी उनका समर्थन करेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please allow him...(*Interruptions*)...Please allow him...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR (Andhra Pradesh) : Why are you so annoyed? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: ...(*Interruptions*)... Please come to your point. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, यह क्या हो रहा है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN (Kerala): This is not a debate ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaitley, you come to your point. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: How do you misuse ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Raghavan, Mr. Raghavan, please, be calm. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री राजू परमार (गुजरात) : सभापति महोदय, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : रात के 12.00 बजे तक भी बैठना पड़ेगा, तो बैठेंगे। आप चिंता मत करिये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, let me just remind this hon. House, through you - and this passage has already been quoted in the last few years several times by my friend Mr. Sibal.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then you don't quote it. Everybody knows it.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, there is a sentence where the Supreme Court has approvingly quoted, and I will quote just one sentence, "No Minister of the Crown - this is what they said in England and the Supreme court approved it in the Indian context - can tell him, that is, the police officer, that he must or must not keep observation on this place or that, or, that he must or must not prosecute this man or that person. Nor can any police authority tell him to do so. The responsibility for law enforcement lies on him alone. He alone has the discretion to decide whom to prosecute, whom not to prosecute." Sir, there are atleast seven cases in the last

seven months which have come to notice where there has been a pattern on which the investigative agencies in this country have functioned. Sir, early this year, a judgement of the criminal court in Faizabad had discharged the Leader of the Opposition in the Lok Sabha, Shri L.K. Advani. The Central Bureau of Investigation took its own decision in the matter as to how to proceed further in the matter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY (Karnataka): To whom are you giving sermons? ...*(Interruptions)*...You have a Deputy Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: I am giving sermons to the Prime Minister's Office. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: To whom are you giving sermons? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Yes, I am giving sermons to the Prime Minister's Office which is subverting the law. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH (Andhra Pradesh) : Sir, yesterday only, Shri Poojary quoted a rule not to disturb while other Members are speaking ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: If you are giving sermons, you should follow them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, let me come to each one of them ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, we now have a case, where an independent decision taken by the Central Bureau of Investigation, is being grossly interfered with by the Prime Minister's Office, the highest office in the land - I have already authenticated this document ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I have already authenticated this document and place it before you, where the Prime Minister's Office, on the 8th of December, 2004, wrote to the Secretary, Personnel - the Department of Personnel is the administrative department which deals with the Central Bureau of Investigation - about Mr. Advani's case. "In this regard, I have been asked to consult the Ministry of Law and Justice (a) to examine if there is any legal provision and the grounds for CBI to file a revision against the discharge of Mr. L.K. Advani at this stage; and, (b) to examine if there is any negligence on the part of investigative or prosecuting agency in not filing a revision petition on time.

...(*Interruptions*)...The CBI has also informed that two witnesses have filed a revision in the High Court against the discharge of Shri L.K. Advani, which is being heard. In this regard, I have been asked to consult the Ministry of Law and Justice to examine if a decision on the revision petition can be expedited. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, there are several other issues which have to be raised. It is a matter of great public importance. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is enough.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, who has asked the author of this letter in order to ensure that how the CBI has to act? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु (पश्चिमी बंगाल): सर, ये और कितनी देर बोलेंगे? **...(व्यवधान)...** फिर हम भी इस पर बोलेंगे। **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Now, the Prime Minister's Office has to tell the Department of Personnel and the Law Ministry has to interfere in the matter in order to make sure that the CBI acts in a particular manner, and not in any other manner. We are today being told that it is only a matter of seeking information. This document, Sir, does not seek information; it tries to find out negligence, if any, in the CBI; it tries to explore whether there are grounds for filing a review petition; it tries to expedite the process of filing a revision. It is a letter, which amounts to a direction to the Central Bureau of Investigation. This is a gross interference. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have mentioned that there are, at least, seven cases ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति : छोड़िए, उनको अब छोड़ दीजिए। **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री अरुण जेटली : सभापति महोदय, अगर आपको इसके उदाहरण देने शुरू करूं **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री सभापति : नहीं-नहीं। मैं उदाहरण नहीं सुनूंगा। **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, यह आवश्यक है क्योंकि यह बहुत गंभीरता का विषय है। **...(व्यवधान)...** इसी के साथ-साथ अगर मैं आपको उदाहरण देने शुरू करूं तो **...(व्यवधान)...**

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM) : Sir, have you permitted him to raise seven cases? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I am not yielding. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, I am asking, have you permitted him to raise seven cases? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, how long will he speak? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, two of those cases relate to Ministers of the UPA Government. How investigative agencies are asked ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, have you permitted him to raise seven cases? We will raise 17 cases then. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, हमें भी दो मिनट का समय दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, क्या यह डिसकशन हो रही है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, दो ऐसे मामले हैं जिनमें यूपीए सरकार के मंत्रियों के खिलाफ जब न्यायपालिका फैसला देती है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : अभी आपने इनको इजाजत दी इसलिए आपको ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: My learned friend, Mr. Chidambaram, the Finance Minister, knows better than me how various authorities in this Government, both constitutional authorities and extra-constitutional authorities ...(*interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, how long will he speak? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Five minutes. ...(*Interruptions*)... I will allow you also. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री मूल चन्द मीणा (राजस्थान) : सर, इतनी देर हो गयी है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप बैठिए न। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप जल्दी करिए न। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

एक माननीय सदस्य : इतनी देर हो गयी है, क्या यह डिबेट हो रही है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप जल्दी करिए बस। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : आधा घंटा हो गया है।

श्री सभापति : हां, हो गया होगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, a Minister of this Government was discharged by the Trial Court in a case of possession of disproportionate assets. No revision, no appeal to be filed against that. There is the case of a former Minister, supporter of this Government, a former Petroleum Minister, where the CBI says it wants to file a chargesheet against him. Section 19 of the Prevention of Corruption Act very clearly says, "For past

public servants, no sanction is required." The Home Ministry, which does not come into the matter, says it will not give a sanction and, therefore, he cannot be prosecuted. † ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, complete. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I have with me...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaitley, please, complete. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Please, allow me to complete, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : छोड़िए, अब हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : यह क्या हो रहा है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री प्रेमचन्द गुप्ता : †

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट रुकिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, how long will he speak? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, finish. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA: Sir, how can you allow him to speak like this? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट रुकिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मेरी बात तो सुनिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं निकाल देता हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : यह एक अजीब सा ...**(व्यवधान)**... कोई precedent नहीं है, हाउस में इस तरह से बोलने ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री प्रेमचन्द गुप्ता : सब-ज्यूडिस केस को यहां डिसकस करने को अलाऊ कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... Sir, this is not fair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, मैं तो यहां तक तैयार हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट ...**(व्यवधान)**... जेटली साहब, आपने जो केस ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट रुकिए। आप ही के मामले में कह रहा हूं, आप बैठिए। आप ही के मामले में कह रहा हूं।..(व्यवधान)..मैं यह कह रहा था ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, मेरी बात तो सुनिए..(व्यवधान)..

---

† Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : मिनिस्टर हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप इनका रेफरेंस मत दीजिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सभापति जी, मैं किसी भी ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : यह जो बिहार के केस का आपने reference दिया है ...**(व्यवधान)**... बिहार के केस का जो reference आपने दिया है, उसमे मिनिस्टर को पहले नोटिस देना चाहिए था। आपने नोटिस नही दिया, इसलिए मैं उसको प्रोसीडिंग्ज़ से expunge करता हूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Expunge कर दिया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA: Sir, he cannot go on speaking like this. ...*(Interruptions)*... He cannot speak on any issue that he wants to raise. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सभापति जी, मैंने आपको परसो भी एक नोटिस दिया था, जो विषय कल आपने अपनी रूलिग मे कहा कि चैम्बर मे आपको बतलाउंगा कि वह सब-ज्यूडिस है या नही है। यह सबसे गंभीर मामला है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: How can that be referred to here, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अरुण जेटली : मैंने तो उनको बताया ही नहीं है, पंजाब का मामला हम लोग रेज़ करेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI MOTILAL VORA (Chhattisgarh): Sir, that should not be allowed.

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, चैम्बर वाली बात भी यहां पर हो रही है। यह हो सकता है क्या? ...**(व्यवधान)**... चैम्बर में क्या बात हुई है, ये यहां refer कर रहे हैं। क्या कुछ भी व्यवस्था नहीं रहेगी सदन में? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप इसी मामले तक सीमित रहिए।

श्री अरुण जेटली : सभापति जी, ये सारी चीज़ें ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : सारी की सारी चीजो के लिए मैं allow नहीं करूंगा, आप जो बोल लिए, That is sufficient.

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, आपकी रूलिंग के बावजूद भी इस तरह से हल्ला हो रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, how can he dictate terms to us? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : मेरी रूलिंग हो गई, जेटली जी, अब आप खत्म कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु (कर्णाटक): सर, यह कोई मतलब नहीं है?

श्री सभापति : क्या?

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : सर, हमारे यहां बैठने का कोई मतलब नहीं है। हमे ये लोग डिक्टेट करेंगे कि कौन बोलेगा, क्या बोलना चाहिए और कितना बोलना है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मेरी सुनिए, डिक्टेट मैं करूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कोई और डिक्टेट नहीं कर रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : वे लोग कर रहे हैं।

श्री सभापति : कोई भी नही कर रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : अभी ये लोग कर रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : कोई नहीं कर रहा है, आप बैठ जाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA: Sir, he should not refer to all the cases. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : अब आप खत्म कीजिए। जेटली जी, आप खत्म कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, मैं दो और विषयों का ज़िक्र करके अपनी बात खत्म करता हूं। पंजाब के मुख्य मंत्री का जो मामला था ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : वह मत लाइए.....वह मत लाइए यहां। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं allow नहीं करूंगा। ....मैं इसको allow नहीं करूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : इसका नोटिस आपको दिया है। आपको इसके details दिए हैं, तब आपने कहा कि ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मुझे ऐसे कोई निर्णय नहीं देना है। वह मामला बिलकुल अलग है। जो आपने ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट....एक मिनट... ...**(व्यवधान)**... .

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: He is not allowed to speak on every case. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, what is all this?

श्री सभापति : उसको मैं allow नहीं कर रहा हूं।

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, there are cases after cases where investigations are being closed. My learned friend, the Finance Minister, is here. ...*(Interruptions)*... The cases and investigations of agencies, such as

the Enforcement Directorate and the DRI, against persons who have been involved in money laundering--I am referring to the case of ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... He should give a notice and bring a motion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOTILAL VORA: Sir, how has he been allowed to speak like this? ...*(Interruptions)*...

प्रो. राम देव भंडारी (बिहार): सर, आप इसको allow कर रहे हैं? आप किस तरह से allow कर रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : जेटली जी, बैठिए। एक मिनट बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, एक प्वाइंट आप clarify कर दीजिए कि ये जो सारे विषय आ रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...Just a minute. Sir, what I am requesting is that if there are serious subjects.....*(Interruptions)*... Sir, if these are serious subjects, which the hon. Member wants to raise in the House, he can give a proper notice under the proper rule; you can examine that, and there can be a full-fledged discussion. But in the name of raising this, he cannot go on referring to all these cases.

श्री सभापति : जेटली जी, अब आप खत्म कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: He cannot go on speaking like this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I can substantiate each one of these cases. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, ये बाकायदा नोटिस दे दें। आप examine कर लें कि चर्चा होनी है, तो चर्चा होगी, इसमें क्या प्रॉब्लम है? I think, the Government has never said that it will not agree to a discussion in a structured manner.

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, I have no objection if the hon. Member, Mr. Arun Jaitley, raises any issue on which you have permitted him to raise here. He says he has got seven cases. Have you permitted him to raise and mention those seven cases. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just a moment, please. If he has given a notice specifying the seven cases and you, in your judgment, have said, "You can raise those seven cases", let him raise them. But, Sir, he cannot list case after case as if this is a court of law where he is giving citations and expect me to stand up here, or any other

Minister to stand up here, and respond. Therefore, I most humbly ask you, Sir: Have you permitted him to mention each one of these seven cases or each one of the seventy cases in his portfolio or have you permitted him to mention one genuine case?

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: I have given a notice to you, Sir, on the issue of subversion of investigative agencies, interference in the functioning of investigative agencies and influencing the functioning on political grounds. I am only giving the factual information in order to substantiate what I have said. ...(*Interruptions*)... May I just say this? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please conclude. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, may I just say this? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति : अब आप छोड़िए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, how can he go on speaking? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, since the Finance Minister has taken an objection... (Interruptions)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, have you given him permission to speak on a general subject or on a specific issue? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I should be allowed to complete. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति : आप खत्म करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, I am told that the Members are allowed to speak with special permission. Was this special permission granted to speak on a specific issue or on a general gamut of issues? ...(*Interruptions*)...It is on a specific issue. Let him mention it and sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)...He can't speak on a general gamut of issues. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, you allow me to complete in two minutes. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति : आप खत्म करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, आप मुझे दो मिनट में खत्म करने की अनुमति दे दें। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप खत्म करिए।

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: I was only trying to give illustrations. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You don't give illustrations.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: I can only give illustrations to substantiate the case. ...*(Interruptions)*... Since the Finance Minister has taken an objection that I can't give these illustrations, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : I said, "unless you get permission". ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: ....will the Finance Minister be kind enough to let us know, through you, Sir, whether he has been under pressure and influence from...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: ... any authority, whether it is a constitutional authority in the Government or any extra-constitutional authority, to close cases? I am referring to the case of First Global which, under pressure and directions... ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: I will answer that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: .... of an extra-constitutional authority in this Government, you have closed down, even though investigations against them are pending and huge tax evasion cases against them are pending. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, since the Finance Minister is going to respond to it, I have to put two questions. Mr. Jaitley has read out a letter purportedly written by one officer to another officer. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : आप बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह स्थिति है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Sir, therefore, I would like to know from the Government whether, earlier also, the Prime Minister's Office has written on the same subject because my information is that... ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री कलराज मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, क्या इन्होंने नोटिस दिया है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति :आप बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सुनिए, ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, एक मिनट। आप किस बात के लिए कह रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप किस बात के लिए कह रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप इनको बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया (झारखंड) : जब सवाल उठा है तो जवाब क्यों नही दे रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, हमारा भी सवाल है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री रुद्रनारायण पणि (उड़ीसा) : सर, यहां पर फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप बैठिए, ...**(व्यवधान)**... .एक मिनट बैठ जाइए ...**(व्यवधान)**... अरे, महाराज विराजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, हमारा भी विरोध है, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैं इतना ही निवेदन करूंगा कि ये मेरी अनुमति से बोल रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मेरी अनुमति से बोल रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सदन मे जो मुद्दा उठाया जाता है, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, ये तय करेगे कि हम क्या बोलेंगे? ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, ये सरकार से सवाल उठा सकते हैं, हम नही उठा सकते? ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या यही आपका न्याय है, ...**(व्यवधान)**... ये सवाल उठा सकते हैं, हम नहीं उठा सकते। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैंने इनको परमिशन दी है। ये अपनी मर्जी से नहीं बोल रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैंने परमिशन दी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कोई मुद्दा उठाये या नहीं उठे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मेरी सुनिए, कोई मुद्दा उठे ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, मेरी सुन लीजिए .. ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप बैठ जाइए। एक मिनट सुनिए। . ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं नहीं बैठूंगा। मैं केवल इतना निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि आप कोई भी मुद्दा उठाएं तो उसमें बीच में बोलने वाले तो बहुत हैं, सरदार जी।

श्री सभापति : मैं इतना ही कह सकता हूं, अगर कोई मेरी अनुमति से बोल रहा हो तो आपको उसे बोलने देना चाहिए और ये मेरी अनुमति से बोल रहे हैं।

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, I have heard what Mr. Jaitley has asked. Additionally, I would like to know from the Government whether it is a fact that two writ petitions in the court are awaiting to find out whether 120 (b) was dropped from the case in the chargesheet on the Ayodhya matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... यह पूछा है, यह इन्फोर्मेशन है I would like to know

whether it is also a fact that in the NDA Government also a similar letter had gone from the PMO asking the question as to how ...*(Interruptions)*..... was dropped from the CBI chargesheet.

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सभापति जी, यह रूल बुक मे भी लिखा है **...(व्यवधान)...** स्पेशल मेशन में **...(व्यवधान)...** .एसोसिएट करने के लिए कोई उठ सकता है **...(व्यवधान)...** अन्यथा सरकार उसका जवाब दे, नही तो मिनिस्टर ऑफ पर्सनल यहां बैठे हैं, वे जवाब दे दें **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री सभापति : मैंने अलाऊ किया है **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया : आपने उनको अलाऊ कर दिया **...(व्यवधान)...** किंतु अभी सब-ज्यूडिस मसला उठा है **...(व्यवधान)...** नही तो मिनिस्टर ऑफ पर्सनल हैं यहां पर **...(व्यवधान)...** वे जवाब दें **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री सभापति : अच्छा, मैं देख रहा हूं **...(व्यवधान)...** मुझे किसको अलाऊ करना है, किसको अलाऊ नहीं करना है **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री रुद्रनारायण पणि : सभापति जी **...(व्यवधान)...** सब ज्यूडिस मैटर के सारे वक्तव्यों को एक्सपंज किया जाए **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the outset, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak and also express my anguish that this forum, which is the highest forum of discussion and debate in a parliamentary democracy, is sought to be misused by deliberate political statements and also aspersions which are unwarranted. ...*(Interruptions)*...Allow me to speak. When he was speaking, I did not interfere. ...*(Interruptions)*...आप बैठ जाइए, सुनिए **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री सुरेन्द्र लाठ (उड़ीसा): सभापति जी, ये सदन को गुमराह कर रहे हैं **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री सभापति : आप बैठ जाइए **...(व्यवधान)...** सदन गुमराह नहीं होगा **...(व्यवधान)...** क्या आप जैसे विद्वान आदमी गुमराह होंगे **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have heard Shri Arun Jaitely with patience and his colleagues do not have the patience and the culture of listening to ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री रुद्रनारायण पणि : हमने सारा देखा है **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री सभापति : मेरी सुनिए, आप बैठिए **...(व्यवधान)...**

प्रो. रामबख्श सिंह वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश): सभापति जी, ये सदन को गुमराह कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैं समझता हूं कि आप बहुत विद्वान लोग हैं, गुमराह करने से गुमराह नही होगे ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, the matter which Shri Arun Jaitely has raised definitely requires a response. We fully agree that there are agencies and constitutional authorities created in this country and those authorities and institutions have functioned since the Constitution was adopted. ...(*Interruptions*)... During the last few years, there have been instances when there was direct interference in the functioning of the investigating agencies...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सुरेन्द्र लाठ : सभापति जी, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप बीच-बीच में डिस्टर्ब कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... .मैं आपको बता देता हूं कि मेरी सहनशक्ति की भी कोई सीमा है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, there have been incidents when doubts were raised why the investigating agency being referred to here did not act as per the letter of the law *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Don't discuss issues which are before the Court...(*Interruptions*)...Kindly, *sub judice* matters should be avoided...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: He referred to that...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has not referred to that. You can only mention the case; you cannot go into the merits of the case.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I respect your ruling, and I hope this applies to Mr. Arun Jaitley and to what he has said, and that records would be checked. I would like to know from the Government (a) whether there was any previous instance during the last six years when letters and memos had gone from the Prime Minister's Office interfering with both the investigating process and the judicial process. I would also like to know from the hon. Minister whether there is any record that in one particular case -- I am not taking the name -- an extra constitutional authority, called the RSS, had approached the Prime Minister's Office...(*Interruptions*)...This

---

* Not recorded.

extra constitutional authority interfered with the day-to-day functioning of the Government ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अरुण जेटली : पंजाब के मुख्यमंत्री का मामला ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैं एलाऊ नहीं कर रहा हूँ, एलाऊ नही करूँगा ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं एलाऊ नहीं कर रहा हूँ, ना करूँगा ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, पंजाब के मुख्यमंत्री का मामला कल रेफर किया तो आपने कहा कि उसको नहीं लेंगे ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : नही लिया।

श्री अरुण जेटली : तो क्या यह आरएसएस वाला मामला रेकार्ड मे जाएगा?

श्री सभापति : ठीक है, आप बोलिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... देखिए, मैं एक बात कह देता हूँ कि जो मामले सबज्युडिस हैं, उनके संबंध में कोई भी रेफरेंस आएगा, वह रेकार्ड नहीं होगा .. ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक आया हो, तो बता दें ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक भी आया हो, तो मुझे बता दे .. ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप जिद मत कीजिए ...**(व्यवधान)**... इन्होंने एक भी मामले को रेफर किया है तो बता दें I will expunge it ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप बैठ जाइए ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं खड़ा हूँ, आप बैठ जाइए ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह क्या कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं आपको यह ऐश्योर करता हूँ कि ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं आपको यह ऐश्योर करता हूँ कि कोई भी माननीय सदस्य सबज्युडिस मैटर के संबंध में कोई चर्चा करेगा, वह सदन की प्रोसीडिंग में नहीं जाएगा, वह चाहे इधर से बोलें या उधर से बोले, और इसलिए मैंने कल ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप एक मिनट ठहर जाएँ ...**(व्यवधान)**... इसलिए मैंने कल पंजाब वाले मामले में यह व्यवस्था दी थी कि सबज्युडिस मैटर में बोलने नही देंगे ...**(व्यवधान)**... देखिए, आज नहीं है, कल था ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज है तो फिर कहने की जरूरत ही क्या है ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज नहीं है, कल था और कल था, इसलिए मैंने रोका था ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप एक मिनट सुन लीजिए। इसलिए मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहूँगा कि बोलना हो, सरकार के खिलाफ बोलें, प्रशासनिक मामलों में बोलें, मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है, लेकिन आप ज्युडिशियरी को किसी तरह से भी अपने डेलिबरेशन से इम्प्रेस करना चाहेंगे, वह मैं एलाऊ नहीं करूँगा ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं आपकी बात सुनुंगा ही नही ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट ...**(व्यवधान)**... मेरी सुनिए, मैं लीडर ऑफ ऑपोजिशन से निवेदन करूँगा कि आपके मैम्बर्स मेरे खड़े होने के बाद भी अगर इस प्रकार से इन्टरफेयर करेंगे तो मेरी स्थिति क्या होगी, इसका अंदाजा लगा लें।

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Sir, Shri Arun Jaitley, my good friend and an able lawyer, gave a notice to you yesterday to raise an issue, and you in your judgement, gave your ruling. Having failed in his effort yesterday to bring up that issue, he is now trying to raise what appears to be, according to him, an issue of principle or policy. And, in the guise of mentioning that issue, he made a valiant, but thankfully a futile, attempt to refer to specific cases. I am glad, Sir, and I am grateful to you for the ruling, that no specific case can be referred to, as invariably all of them are

sub judice, and, if any one of them is not *sub judice*, he is obliged to give a specific notice so that the Government is ready with the answer, if any. I shall, therefore, abide by your ruling and deal with the point raised by Mr. Jaitley as a point of principle.

The principle that Mr. Jaitley is articulating is that investigating agencies are independent and, therefore, no Minister of the Crown is entitled to interfere with the working, or, ask them to do this or do that. No one questions that principle. But the question that Mr. Jaitley should ask himself is: was this principle breached in the last six months or not? ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, I have just made a rhetorical question. Why does he answer? Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, I am entitled to... ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Let him answer whether the Prime Minister's Office is breaching that principle or not. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Please listen to me. ...(*Interruptions*)... Was this principle breached in the past or not? I will be happy if Mr. Jaitley can search his conscience and stand up and say that this principle was not breached in the last six years. I will be happy if he can say that. But let me say, Sir, that, today I can look Mr. Jaitley in his eye and tell him that that principle has not been breached in this Government in the last six months. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: No. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Just a moment. ...(*Interruptions*)... I will answer it. ...(*Interruptions*)...Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: It is a directive...(*Interruptions*)...to the CBI. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Negligence of the CBI should be probed. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, there is another principle. The other principle is that every Minister is answerable to this House. The Government is collectively responsible to this House. If there are administrative failures, if there are cases of negligence, the House is entitled to call the Government to answer why there has been negligence, or, failure, or, malfeasance. The very judgment that Mr. Jaitley relies upon - if he will

read it more carefully - there is a whole passage where Chief Justice Verma lists five principles and says that in the above five situations, the Minister is entitled to review the working of the administrative agency, or, the investigating agency. So, when you quote the judgment, you must quote the judgment in full. Five separate situations serially numbered, are there in the judgment where Chief Justice Verma says, in the following cases, these are the Ministers' duties and the Minister must ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: And certainly, filing an appeal, or, not filing an appeal does not ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: He does not read the judgment. What can I do? Therefore, Sir, the point is, while a Minister must not interfere with the working of an investigating agency, the Minister is entitled to ask whether there was negligence in the past in the working of the investigating agency, because if there was negligence, the Minister is answerable to this House why the investigating agency could not...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It means you admit that this letter has been written to the investigating agency.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: No, Sir. Wait a minute. I am assuming what he is saying is correct. He was reading the letter. ...*(Interruptions)*...You are reading the letter. The Chairman is asking me, "Do you admit", and I am saying, I am assuming what my friend is saying is true. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am assuming that the letter you are reading is correct. The point is, if there was negligence in the past, this Government is entitled to ask the agency, "Were you negligent?' Have you been negligent"? And the agency must satisfy the Government if there was any negligence.

Sir, let me answer the general question. The Enforcement Directorate and no other department in the Ministry of Finance has been under any direction, or, pressure, or, influence of any authority to do this or do that in any case and I can say that with the clearest conscience. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, the Finance Minister does not answer whether he receives communications from various extra-constitutional authorities in order to tackle a particular case in a particular manner. ...*(Interruptions)*...How are the cases withdrawn? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Sir, don't allow like this. ...(*Interruptions*)... This is not the case. ...(*Interruptions*)...Sir, are you allowing this? ...(*Interruptions*)...Sir, are you allowing this question-answer session again? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): Sir, I would like to say something because he has referred to the PMO; he has referred to my Ministry. I have every right to react to that.

श्री सभापति : मैं बोलता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट आप बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपका अधिकार है। मैं उस अधिकार को मना नही करता, लेकिन माननीय मंत्री महोदय ने कह दिया है, उसके बाद में ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, please permit me to react to this. ...(*Interruptions*)...Just have the patience to listen. ...(*Interruptions*)...Sir, I am speaking with your kind permission. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : अब क्या कुछ बात करनी रह गई है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : इसका यह मतलब नहीं है कि सवाल उठाएंगे और जवाब नहीं सुनेगे ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Please have the patience to listen. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति : आप बोलने दीजिए न। दिक्कत क्या है?

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Please have the patience.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He is the concerned Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सी.बी.आई. को लिखा है। उस सम्बन्ध में अगर मंत्री महोदय इसका जवाब देंगे कि लिखा है कि नहीं लिखा है, क्या लिखा है, क्यों लिखा है तो आपको क्या आपत्ति है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, I am grateful to you that you have given me the permission to clarify the points raised by my learned colleague, Shri Jaitley. Sir, Shri Jaitley has mainly raised three points. One, interference by the PMO in the functioning of the CBI. Two, interference in the investigation regarding political executives and the direction by the PMO to the CBI. Some other colleagues have also raised some points. I would like

1.00 P.M.

to make it very clear that the PMO of Dr. Manmohan Singh has never interfered in the functioning of the CBI.

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद (बिहार): यह चिट्ठी क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI:. I will come to that. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : यह चिट्ठी क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**... इसमें लिखा हुआ है "I have been directed.. " इन शब्दों का मतलब क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: I will come to that.

श्री सभापति : आ रहे हैं। उसका जवाब देंगे ...**(व्यवधान)**... बैठ जाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... ठीक है। ठीक है।

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Who has asked the Joint Secretary to write this letter?

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: I will come to that, Mr. Jaitley. I will come to that. I will mention about other letters also. Don't worry. ...(*Interruptions*)... Number two, never has the PMO interfered with the CBI investigations. The PMO did not give directions to the CBI. But to say that the PMO has no right to ask for information from the CBI, or, to be apprised of the legal and constitutional position in any case is, to say the least, completely wrong.

Sir, the letter from the PMO written by one of the officers is mentioned by Mr. Jaitley. The letter sent from the Prime Minister's Office to the Secretary, Department of Personnel and Training is in the context of the revision petition in the High Court against the discharge of Shri L.K. Advani, filed by two witnesses, which Mr. Nilotpal Basu wanted to know. It may be noted that the reference from the Prime Minister's Office only requested clarifications on the legal position about filing of a revision petition. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, I am not yielding. ...(*Interruptions*)...I am not yielding. Let me complete. ...(*Interruptions*)... Let me complete.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: The same letter has a different meaning to you and to the rest of the world. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: I am not yielding. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, I am not yielding. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, let me complete. ...(*Interruptions*)...Sir, it may be noted that the reference from the Prime Minister's Office only requested clarification on the legal position about filing

of a revision petition and failure, if any, on the part the prosecuting/investigating agency in taking timely action to move the High Court.

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, आपके पास चिट्ठी है, आप चिट्ठी को पढ़कर खुद देखिए। यह जो मंत्री जी कह रहे हैं, यह गुमराह कर रहे हैं पूरे सदन को। आपके पास चिट्ठी है, देख लीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : बैठिए। वह चिट्ठी मैंने देख ली है। मैं गुमराह होने वाला नहीं हूँ, इतना मैं कह सकता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, I am not yielding. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, when I listened to them, they should have the patience to listen to all of us. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the sum total of this correspondence is nothing more than eliciting information from the investigating or prosecuting agency. It is not a directive. I mentioned that letter, and it is not a directive of any type to any investigating agency and can't be construed to amount to any manner of interference in the working of the agency.

Sir, to seek legal opinion on any issue is the legitimate official communication and falls within the purview of processes within the Governmental machinery. It would; therefore, be wrong to impute any political motive to this routine correspondence. It may also be stated... ...*(Interruptions)*... I am coming to that. I will come to your regime also. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : रवि शंकर जी, ज्यादा बीच में न बोला करें।

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: It may also be stated that no instructions or directions were issued to CBI in this matter. In all such matters, this Government will respect the autonomy of the investigating agency and follow the dictates of the law and judicial decisions.

As asked by Shri Nilotpal Basu, Sir, I would like to mention over here that the Prime Minister's Office of Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee too had asked for and obtained information from the CBI. If you want to know the details of the letter on the same subject which you are referring...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : नहीं, पहले आपको नोटिस देना पड़ेगा इस पर। ...**(व्यवधान)**... नहीं, नहीं, पचौरी जी limit yourself to the subject. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: I can do the authentication if you want.

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : Let the letters be authenticated and laid on the Table of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...सर, अगर वह एक अथेंटिकेट करके ले कर देते हैं, तो मंत्री जी भी अथेंटिकेट करके ले कर देंगे। सदन को पता चलना चाहिए कि सच्चाई क्या है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : नही, नही, मैंने यह परमीशन नही दी है। मेरी परमीशन नही है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, Mr. Jaitley mentioned as a Minister on August 5, 2003, and I quote, Mr. Jaitley: "The CBI is also administratively responsible to a particular Department of the Government, and that is, the Department of Personnel and Training." ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : What is wrong? इसमे गलत क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Just a minute. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, the Department of Personnel and Training is an Administrative Ministry for the CBI to deal with the Budget provisions, administrative sanctions and also legal matters ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : अपील फाइल होगी या नही होगी, इसके लिए नही । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : नही, आप बैठिए, बैठिए।

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: It is not the direction. It is just eliciting the information. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Are you within your rights when you say that you can direct the CBI on what to do? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Therefore, the Government is entitled to know what happened in this case. Sir, similarly, in the regime of NDA...

श्री सभापति : नहीं, वह यहां मत लाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, this is the correspondence from the Prime Minister's Office on 30.9.2003, when Mr. Atal Bihari Vajpayee was the Prime Minister. From the same Prime Minister's Office, a letter was issued to the Cabinet Secretary and from the Cabinet Secretariat to the then Director of CBI on the same case which was referred to over here. I would like to quote from that letter. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I don't allow it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: The pronouncement of the Rae Bareily court...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I quote,...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, how can there be questions and not answers. ...*(Interruptions)*... I had put a question. He is answering to my question. ...*(Interruptions)*... I, as a Member of this House, have every right to know the answer to my question. ...*(Interruptions)*... As a Member of this House that is my privilege. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have the privilege to know...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, on 30.09.2003, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee was the Prime Minister....*(Interruptions)*... The office of Prime Minister, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, had written a letter to the Cabinet Secretary and Cabinet Secretariat to the then Director, CBI seeking examinations its view...*(Interruptions)*... about court discharging the then Deputy Prime Minister from all the charges of demolition of Babri Masjid. ...*(Interruptions)*... I totally deny ...*(Interruptions)*... The baseless charges made by Shri Arun Jaitley...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, आपकी अनुमति के बगैर बोले जा रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो0 राम देव भंडारी : सर, उनको अलाऊ किया है, इनको क्यों नहीं अलाऊ कर सकते? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, I would like to point out at that time the CBI was under the...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (उत्तरांचल): सर, आपने अनुमति नही दी है, फिर कैसे पढ़े जा रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, चेयर के आदेश की अवहेलना और वह भी संसदीय कार्य राज्य मंत्री द्वारा! ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या यह रिकार्ड पर जा रहा है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : माननीय सदस्य, बिना मेरी अनुमति के न बोलें, यह उचित नही है। यह रिकार्ड नहीं होगा, बिल्कुल नहीं होगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कोई रिकार्ड मत करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: I can quote various such letters. ...*(Interruptions)*... Not only this letter...*(Interruptions)*... If you want...*(Interruptions)*... I can elaborate that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I would like to quote from another letter also. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : माननीय मंत्री महोदय, एक मिनट। ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, एक मिनट। जेटली जी ने एक प्रश्न उठाया, उस प्रश्न का आप उत्तर दे रहे हैं।

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु : सर, मैंने भी उठाया।

श्री सभापति : आपने भी उठाया.और भी कई माननीय सदस्यो ने प्रश्न उठाया, राघवन जी ने उठाया और सदस्यों के भी मैं नाम लूंगा, तो काफी सदस्य हैं, जिन्होंने इस मामले को उठाया। प्रश्न उठाने के बाद माननीय मंत्री महोदय बोले, उसके बाद आप बोल रहे हैं। अब आप नए इस्यूज़ को ला रहे हैं। **...(व्यवधान)...**

प्रो0 राम देव भंडारी : उनके प्रश्न का जवाब दिया जा रहा है, कोई नया इस्यू नही है।

श्री सभापति : नये इस्यूज़ को मत लाइए।

नीलोत्पल बसु : मैंने जो सवाल उठाया कि पिछली सरकार में भी यह हुआ था क्या उसका जवाब दिया है, इसमें नया इस्यू क्या है? **...(व्यवधान)...**

प्रो0 राम देव भंडारी : पिछली सरकार ने क्या-क्या किया, उसकी जानकारी भी होनी चाहिए। **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I want to make one submission. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am also on a point of order. I am a Member of this House. When a matter is raised by the other side, I, as a Member, ask the Government whether in the past any direction from the PMO had been directly sent to the CBI in this matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is my right to know. ...*(Interruptions)*... You stand exposed. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are exposed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : आप एक मिनट बैठ जाइए। **...(व्यवधान)...**

एक मिनट **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: Is exposing each other the agenda? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, he is again speaking. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is replying to it ...*(Interruptions)*...No, he is replying to it.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, my question is.. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI PRITHVIRAJ CHAVAN): Sir, let the Minister complete. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the hon. Member speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI : No;. Sir, I have yet to finish reading the letter which was written... ...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, I have to quote some other letters also which were written during their regime. ...*(Interruptions)*...I have to quote some other letters also. ...*(Interruptions)*...I can quote them. ...*(Interruptions)*...I have got so many letters. ...*(Interruptions)*...The letter which was written by the PMO... ...*(Interruptions)*... That letter was written to the Cabinet Secretary. ...*(Interruptions)*... Thereafter, the Cabinet Secretariat had written a letter to the then Director, CBI. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, in the letter.. ...*(Interruptions)*...*

श्री सभापति : कोई रिकार्ड नहीं होगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI:....when Mr. Arun Jaitley was also a Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I have to quote some other things also. ...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, let me quote. ...*(Interruptions)*...It is not an offence to quote a letter written from one Officer to another Officer. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : जेटली जी, आप बोलिए, आपको क्या कहना है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: It is not an offence. ...*(Interruptions)*...Mr. Jaitley is an eminent lawyer. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, can I quote the letter? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : पचौरी जी, इतना गुस्सा मत करो। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इतना गुस्सा मत करो। ....**(व्यवधान)**... जेटली जी, आप बोलिए, आपको क्या कहना है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जल्दी कीजिए, क्या कहना है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I have only three points to make in response to what my hon. colleague from the other side has said. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute...*(Interruptions)*..There is a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...There is a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: No, Sir, I have to quote some other things also. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I am sitting. ...*(Interruptions)*...I have got some other letters also which were written. ...*(Interruptions)*...No, Sir, let me

---

* Not recorded.

quote. ...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, please allow me to quote other letters also. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR: Sir, we are concerned about the health of Shri Suresh Pachouri. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: We are concerned about your credibility. ...*(Interruptions)*...You are being exposed. ...*(Interruptions)*...In fact, you are being exposed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : अब आप बैठिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: How can he be allowed to speak?

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I will take two minutes...(*Interruptions*)... सर, मैं दो मिनट में समाप्त कर दूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please wait for two minutes...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have to raise other matter. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have sought intervention ...(*Interruptions*)... about the direct interference and instructions to the Director, CBI, during the NDA Government...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, अब 18 लाख पर आइये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप बैठ जाइये। आप बैठ जाइये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...आप बैठ जाइये। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जेटली जी, आप बोलिये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, can we continue a debate like this? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, अगर उधर से सदस्य बैठ जाये, तो मैं दो-तीन मिनट मे अपनी बात समाप्त कर दूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, वाजपेयी जी की चिट्ठी पर पाइंट आफ आर्डर कैसे हो सकता है? ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, पूर्व प्राइम मिनिस्टर की चिट्ठी पर पाईंट आफ आर्डर उठा रहे हैं। यह उचित नही है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...Sir, this is a letter from the ex-Prime Minister. They are raising a point of order on that...(*Interruptions*)... This is an insult to the ex-Prime Minister...(*Interruptions*)... It cannot be tolerated. ...(*Interruptions*)... A letter from the ex-Prime Minister has been quoted. ...(*Interruptions*)... They are raising a point of order on that...(*Interruptions*)... It is an insult to the ex-Prime Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)... सर, हमारे पूर्व प्रधान मंत्री जी की चिट्ठी पर पाइंट आफ आर्डर नहीं हो सकता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...उनकी कितनी अच्छी

चिट्ठी है, उसको आप पढ़िये। ...**(व्यवधान)**...सर, उनकी चिट्ठी पर कैसे पाइंट आफ आर्डर उठा रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैं एक मिनट मे मामला खत्म करता हूं । ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, we have given a notice on Gujarat issue...(*Interruptions*)... Gujarat issue must be discussed. ...(*Interruptions*)... I must be allowed to speak on Gujarat matter. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : सर, काफी हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA (Uttar Pradesh) : Sir, he has quoted one letter. ...(*Interruptions*)... He wants to quote ten letters.. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, ऐसे हाउस नही चल पायेगा। अगर ये दो मिनट नही बोलने देगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, क्या ट्रेजरी बेंचिज़ इस तरह से हाउस को डिस्टर्ब करेगी? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Sir, he has made a point. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have replied. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Pachouri has replied...(*Interruptions*)... The matter should come to an end. ...(*Interruptions*)... Why are you allowing them to speak continuously? ...(*Interruptions*)... He has made a point. I have replied...(*Interruptions*)... The matter should come to an end...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Sir, he has quoted one letter. ...(*Interruptions*)... He should be allowed to quote ten letters. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, ट्रेजरी बेंचिज़ हाउस को डिस्टर्ब कर रही हैं। ....**(व्यवधान)**... सर, ट्रेजरी बेंचिज़ पूरे हाउस को डिस्टर्ब कर रही हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... पार्लियामेंट्री अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaitley, what do you want to say? Please say in two minutes.

श्री अरुण जेटली : सभापति जी, आपने मुझे बोलने की अनुमति दी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...You have permitted me to respond...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : आप इतने अच्छे बोलने वाले हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, अब तहलका देख लेते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaitley, what do you want to say? Please say in two minutes...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अरुण जेटली : आप दो मिनट का समय दे दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Sir, I am extremely grateful to you for just permitting me to respond to some new and additional points which have been made. ...*(Interruptions)*...

प्रो0 सैफुद्दीन सोज (जम्मू और कश्मीर) : सर, वे काफी बोल चुके हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

आप उनको फिर क्यो बोलने दे रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, is this a debate? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सर, मैं दो मिनट का समय लूंगा । ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, ऐसे तो खत्म नहीं होगा और आगे तहलका पर नही चलेगा। Sir, you have permitted me to respond. ...**(व्यवधान)**...सर, आपने बोलने की अनुमति दी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट, एक मिनट। एक मिनट ...**(व्यवधान)**... पचौरी जी, आप बैठ जाइये। मुझे सारी चर्चा में यह समझ मे आया है कि इन्होने एक लेटर का उल्लेख किया है या दो-तीन घटनाओं का उल्लेख किया है। अब उसको जस्टिफाई करने के लिए, इधर से यह कहा जा रहा है कि पुराना भी यह काम चल रहा था । बात तो यही है। ....**(व्यवधान)**...यही बात है न। ..(व्यवधान).. मेरी बात तो सुन लीजिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : उसी केस मे ..**(व्यवधान)**... Sir, on the same case; from the same Prime Minister Office; from one officer to another officer. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : मेरी सुन लीजिए ...**(व्यवधान)**... मेरी बात तो सुन लीजिए ..(व्यवधान)..मैं इतना ही कहना चाहता हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, इतनी ही बात कह रहा हूं कि इन्होने जो प्रश्न उठाया ...**(व्यवधान)**...उन्होने जो सारे विषय उठाए, उन विषयो के जस्टीफिकेशन के लिए इधर से यह कहा जा रहा है कि पहले भी इस तरह की बाते हुई हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... लुब्बो-लुआब यही है कि पहले प्राइम मिनिस्टर ने लैटर लिखा, उन्होने असोसिएट किया ...**(व्यवधान)**...वही तो है; nothing more than that. और कुछ किया नहीं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

एक माननीय सदस्य : ये कह रहे हैं कि जब उन्होने लैटर ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : उन्होने कब कहा है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI JIBON ROY (West Bengal): It is in response to earlier letters. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी: अगर उस चिट्ठी की बात करनी है तो दूसरी चिट्ठियों की भी जानकारी होनी चाहिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : नयी गलतियां करने की छूट नही दी ...**(व्यवधान)**... जो पुरानी गलतियां की गयी, उनको ठीक किया जाए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : बैठ तो जाओ ...**(व्यवधान)**...मैं समझाता हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : इन्होने लैटर का जवाब ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मैं इतना ही कह रहा हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

इन्होंने जो कुछ कहना था, कह दिया। आपने जो कुछ कहना था कह दिया। बात का लुब्बो-लुआब यही निकला ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Sir, there is no rejoinder. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री सभापति : मैं नहीं बोल रहा हूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

I am not talking about the rejoinder. *...(Interruptions)...* मैं बोलने की बात नही कह रहा हूं। मैं तो कह रहा हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट..(व्यवधान)..मैं तो इतनी सी बात कह रहा हूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR: Sir, you have allowed me. *...(Interruptions)...* सर, हम लोग भी बैठे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... हमारा भी मसला है..(व्यवधान)..हमारा भी ध्यान करें..**(व्यवधान)**

श्री सभापति : मैं इतनी बात कह रहा हूं कि ...**(व्यवधान)**... बात तो सुनिए आप ...**(व्यवधान)**... बात तो सुनिए आप ...**(व्यवधान)**... What do you talk of? एक मिनट ...**(व्यवधान)**... Please take your seat. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Let us have a discussion on that issue. *...(Interruptions)...* Let us have a discussion on this issue. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : ठीक है, और क्या बात है ...**(व्यवधान)**... Let the letters come on the record. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री सभापति : इन्होने जो मैटर उठाया, उसका खंडन नही हुआ ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : वे इस बात को स्वीकार कर रहे हैं न।

श्री सभापति : मैं तो अपनी बात कह दूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उसका खंडन नही हुआ। उन्होने स्वीकार किया और पुराने उदाहरण बताए। मामला यही है और इसलिए अब मामला यही खत्म ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो. राम देव भंडारी : सर, आपने मुझे अलाऊ किया है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण जेटली : सभापति महोदय, यह गलत प्रीसीडेंट है कि वहां से केवल ऐतराज़ करेंगे इसलिए आपने मुझसे वह अनुमति वापस ले ली ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपने मुझे अनुमति दी है और उनके केवल ऐतराज करने पर यह अनुमति वापस ले ली। मैंने विषय उठाया है, मैं स्पष्टीकरण मांगना चाहता हूं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: He is challenging the decision of the Chair. This cannot be allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अरुण जेटली : क्योंकि रिप्लाई हो चुका है तो ...**(व्यवधान)**...क्या यह भविष्य के लिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR: Sir, you have permitted me. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have permitted me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH: It is going to be ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सर, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ...**(व्यवधान)**

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : हम चर्चा के लिए तैयार हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि जो पत्र अरुण जेटली जी ने पढ़ा, वह उन्होंने ...**(व्यवधान)**...आपको नोटिस के साथ लगाकर दिया। आपने उसको देख लिया, उसके बाद अनुमति दी। जो उन्होंने उधर से पढ़ा, वह तो न आपके पास आया, न आथेंटिकेट हुआ, इसलिए उसका क्या होगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

श्री मोती लाल वोरा : आपने पहले व्यवस्था दे दी कि वह मामला खत्म हो गया ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : क्या हुआ?

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Why is this argument on your decision? ...*(Interruptions)*... It is over. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : पीठ से दिए गए आदेश की अवहेलना संसदीय कार्य मंत्री ने की और मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह भी है कि संसदीय कार्य मंत्री ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: The matter is over. You have given a ruling. Why is this issue being raised again? There are other issues also. This is not the only issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : संसदीय कार्य मंत्री की जिम्मेदारी सदन में व्यवस्था बनाए रखने में मदद करना होती है। आज सदन में अव्यवस्था का नेतृत्व संसदीय कार्य मंत्री स्वयं कर रहे हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : व्यवस्था हो चुकी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : संसदीय कार्य मंत्री जिस तरह का आचरण कर रहे हैं...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह नहीं है ...**(व्यवधान)**...एक मिनट, व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि इन्होंने जो कुछ उठाया, वह मेरी अनुमति से उठाया, इससे तो आप सब ऐग्री करते हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। इन्होंने जो उठाया, उसका कंडैम नहीं हुआ, यह भी आप मानते हैं।

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी : कंडैम तो हुआ ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्यो नहीं हुआ कंडैम? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : मेरी सुन लीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कंडैम इस रूप मे नहीं हुआ कि किसी माननीय सदस्य ने नहीं कहा कि यह लैटर नही लिखा गया ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : उन्होने स्वीकार किया है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : ठीक है, आप मुझे बोलने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: There is nothing wrong in that letter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट। अब ये कहने लगे कि यह ऐडमिनिस्ट्रेटिव प्रोसीजर है और उसमें कई बार आवश्यकताएं होती हैं कि प्रधानमंत्री को इंटरवीन करना पड़ता है या पधानमंत्री के ऑफिस को इंटरवीन करना पड़ता है। यही है न सारा matter? ...**(व्यवधान)**... एक मिनट, मैं बोल लूं? फिर आप बोल लेना। मैं इनकी तरफ से नहीं कह रहा हूं, मैं अपनी तरफ से कह रहा हूं कि इन्होने जो मामला उठाया, उस पर कोई विवाद नहीं है, नंबर एक। उसमें आपने कहा कि इसमें पुराने उदाहरण इस प्रकार के हैं, जैसी उसमें बात हुई। ...**(व्यवधान)**... प्लीज़, मेरी बात सुनिए ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY : Sir, he has made an allegation.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please, take your seat.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Sir, he has made the allegation...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : कोई allegation नहीं है। आप बैठ जाइए। मुझे खुद को इतनी सी आपत्ति है कि इन्होंने जो letter दिखाया, वह मुझे दिखाया। उसको authenticate किया है, authenticate करके टेबल पर रखा है, लेकिन इन्होंने जो letters रखे हैं या refer किए हैं, वे न तो मुझे दिखाए और न मैंने authenticate किए हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL) : Sir, there is one more thing....*(Interruptions)*...

डा. अलादी पी.राजकुमार : सर, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : आप क्या कह रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH : Sir, this is a very important issue....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVULA CHANDRA SEKAR REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Sir, in Andhra Pradesh...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट, मंत्री जी को सुन लेते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

डा. अलादी पी.राजकुमार : सर, हम आधे घंटे से बोल रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति : एक मिनट.... सुन लीजिए....एक मिनट सुन लीजिए कि मंत्री जी क्या कह रहे हैं?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL : Sir, there is one more thing which should have been done. That letter should have been sent to the Minister also. It is not enough that that letter is shown to the Presiding Officer; it has to go to the Minister also, so that it could be replied to in a proper manner. He has not done that...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister has said that there are letters of the same pattern...

MR. CHAIRMAN : He has also not done that.

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL : Sir, what I am saying is that the procedure is not being fully followed by the hon. Member from that side also.

MR. CHAIRMAN : So, he should not follow that procedure too?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL : No, Sir. I am saying that no allegation or letter should be produced without giving it to the other side also.

श्री सभापति : ठीक है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, सदन मे यह व्यवस्था रही है कि मंत्री जो भी वक्तव्य देता है या बोलता है, उसकी authenticity अपने आप हो जाती है, वह उसके लिए responsible होता है। 1992 मे यह व्यवस्था रही है ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE : Sir, I shall go through the rules...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : माननीय सदस्य, मैं इस संबंध मे सारी पुरानी व्यवस्थाएं देखूंगा और देखने के बाद जो उचित होगा, वह करूंगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...एक मिनट... मैं सारी व्यवस्थाएं देख

लूंगा और अब मैं आऊंगा बेस्ट बेकरी कांड पर ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट सुन लीजिए.... लेकिन खाना खाने के बाद आएंगे, इसलिए सदन एक घंटे के लिए adjourn किया जाता है।

The House then adjourned for lunch at twenty-eight minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty minutes past two of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION - *Contd.*

Inscription in Hindi on the milestones in the National Highways in Tamil Nadu

SHRI P. G. NARAYANAN (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to draw the attention of the House to the grave situation prevailing in Tamil Nadu after the National Highways Authority's move to have Hindi inscription on the milestones in Tamil Nadu. The Hindi inscription on the milestones is being introduced for the first time in Tamil Nadu. The irony is that this measure is being introduced when the Minister of Shipping, Road Transport and Highways belongs to the DMK Party.

Sir, we, the people of Tamil Nadu, are not opposed to any language, including Hindi, but the House and the Central Government should realise the hundred years old popular movement in Tamil Nadu against imposition of Hindi. Sir, in Tamil Nadu, we are following time-tested, two-language formula, and, the Centre should respect the sentiments of seven crore people of our State. Sir, late Prime Minister, Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru had given a solemn assurance to the people of Tamil Nadu, on the floor of the Parliament, that Hindi will not be imposed on non-Hindi speaking people. Sir, the National Highways Authority's move to have Hindi inscription on the milestones in Tamil Nadu is in total contravention of Pandit Nehru's assurance. Sir, I would like to ask: Will the National Highways Authority take steps to inscribe a language like Telugu, Malayalam, or, any other South Indian language on the milestones of the national highways in Uttar Pradesh.

Sir, this three-language formula remains only on papers. Sir, the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu has already written to the Prime Minister drawing his attention to this explosive issue.

I, therefore, appeal to the Centre to remove Hindi inscriptions forthwith from all the milestones in Tamil Nadu in deference to the sentiments of people of Tamil Nadu. Sir, the Minister of Shipping, Road Transport and